Towards Adequate Analysis and Modeling of Structural Adjustment Programs: An Analytical Framework with Application to Ghana

Egor Kraev
School of Public Policy
University of Maryland, College Park

October 10, 2004
Abstract

When a country experiences a balance of payments problem, the typical remedy mix proposed by the International Monetary Fund consists of fiscal austerity, tight monetary policies, devaluation, privatization, elimination of subsidies and trade liberalization, combined with low interest rate loans. Throughout the late 1980s, Ghana has been hailed as a success story for that policy mix. However, Ghana’s performance has been increasingly disappointing during the 1990s. This thesis explores the reasons for that slowdown, its distributional implications, and the extent to which the behavior of the Ghanaian economy validates commonly used assumptions in economic models of developing countries.

We compile a complete consistent yearly dataset of financial stocks, nominal money flows (arranged in Social Accounting Matrices) and real product flows for Ghana in 1990-2001. The real-side data, available yearly, are then examined using fit optimization with alternative functional forms, while nominal time series (Consumer Price Index, the broad money supply and the exchange rate), available on a monthly basis, are analyzed using ARIMA-X regressions.

We find that industrial production, as well as investment, has been demand-constrained during our period, while agriculture has hit an aggregate supply constraint around year 1995. The relative price elasticity of substitution between imports and non-traded goods (in volume terms) is around minus one. The government was the only net source of demand during the period. Inflation could be predicted extremely well using only broad money supply, wholesale price of food crops and price of fuel, and formed a weak positive feedback loop with money supply growth. The main channel through which exchange rate depreciation impacted the price level was revaluation of the foreign currency-denominated money supply component. The response of broad money supply to interest rate increases was significant but small. We also formulate a novel matrix formalism for a more compact description and analysis of financial stock dynamics, cleanly separating structural and accounting constraints from behavioral descriptions.

We conclude that the major reasons for the economic slowdown of the 1990s were excessive liberalization of commodity imports and strangulation of industry through lack of demand and volatile real interest rates, and of agriculture through withdrawal of government support programs.
# Contents

1 Introduction ........................................ 10
   1.1 Research Questions .................................................. 10
      1.1.1 Why Was Macroeconomic Performance Not Sustained? ............ 10
      1.1.2 What Were the Distributive Impacts? ............................ 10
      1.1.3 Does the behavior of the Ghanaian Economy in 1990s conform to the assumptions of economic models? ...................... 11
   1.2 Methods and Intermediate Results .................................... 11
      1.2.1 Compile a Dataset: SAM/FAM time series for 1990-2001 .......... 11
      1.2.2 Statistical Analysis of Selected Variables ..................... 12
      1.2.3 Discussion of Quantitative Results’ Implications ............... 14
   1.3 Results ........................................................... 14
      1.3.1 Neoclassical/Monetarist vs. Structuralist Theory ................ 14
      1.3.2 Reasons for Poor Macroeconomic Performance ....................... 15
      1.3.3 Distributional Impacts ........................................... 15
   1.4 Limitations ......................................................... 16
      1.4.1 No Formal Overall Model ........................................ 16
      1.4.2 Limited Analysis of Distributional Impacts ....................... 17
   1.5 Structure of This Manuscript ...................................... 18

2 Structural Adjustment ........................................... 19
   2.1 What is Structural Adjustment? ..................................... 19
   2.2 A Typical Structural Adjustment Policy Package .................... 19
   2.3 Assessments and Criticisms ....................................... 21

3 Structural Adjustment in Ghana ..................................... 23
   3.1 The economies of Sub-Saharan Africa ............................... 23
   3.2 The case of Ghana .................................................... 24
      3.2.1 Fiscal Policy .................................................... 27
      3.2.2 Monetary Policy ................................................ 29
      3.2.3 Inflation ........................................................ 31
      3.2.4 Labor Market .................................................... 32
      3.2.5 Sectoral Behavior ............................................... 33
      3.2.6 External Trade and Balance of Payments ......................... 35
   3.3 Summary .......................................................... 37
CONTENTS

7.7.1 Are Different Levels of Household Aggregation in Different Parts of the Framework Defensible? .................................................. 86
7.8 Summary ................................................................. 87

8 Decomposing the FAM dynamics 90
8.1 Revaluation .............................................................. 90
8.2 Current Transactions ................................................... 91
8.3 Capital Transactions ................................................... 91
8.4 The Master Equation for FAM Dynamics ............................ 93
8.5 Reconstructing Transaction Flows From FAM Time Series .......... 93
8.6 The Transaction Matrices We Use .................................... 96
8.7 Summary ................................................................. 96

9 Investigation of key individual time series 98
9.1 A method for dealing with short data series ....................... 98
9.2 Supply Side ............................................................. 100
  9.2.1 Incremental Capital-Output Ratio ............................. 100
  9.2.2 Real Investment .................................................. 100
  9.2.3 Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in industrial production . 102
  9.2.4 Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in agricultural production . 103
  9.2.5 Behavior of the Agricultural Sector ........................... 105
9.3 Demand Side ............................................................ 107
  9.3.1 Demand Injection Decomposition ............................. 107
  9.3.2 Net Private Savings .............................................. 107
  9.3.3 Consumption Function ........................................... 110
  9.3.4 Ratio of imports to nontraded goods consumption ............ 110

10 Fix-flex Accounting in an Open Economy 114
10.1 A Fix-Flex Framework in an Open Economy ........................ 114
10.2 Summary ............................................................. 117

11 Econometric Investigation of Monthly Time Series 118
11.1 Introduction ............................................................ 118
11.2 Consumer Price Index ............................................... 119
  11.2.1 Summary .......................................................... 126
11.3 Money Supply .......................................................... 126
  11.3.1 Summary .......................................................... 126
11.4 Price Level - Money Supply Feedback Loop ........................ 133
11.5 Exchange Rate ......................................................... 135
  11.5.1 Summary .......................................................... 139

12 Discussion I: Implications for Theory 141
12.1 Methodological Innovations ........................................... 141
  12.1.1 Dataset Compilation ............................................... 141
  12.1.2 Systematic Integration of Financial Stock Time Series with Flow Data . 142
  12.1.3 Testing Nonlinear Relationships on Short Data Series ......... 142
  12.1.4 A Simple Core for a Dynamic Fix-Flex Model ............... 142
12.1.5 A Compact Formalism for Description and Analysis of Financial Stock Dynamics .................................................. 143
12.2 Structure of the Ghanaian Economy Compared to Common Model Assumptions  .................................................. 143
  12.2.1 Structuralist vs. Monetarist views on Price Formation ................................. 143
  12.2.2 Output Determination and the Balance of Payments .................................. 146
  12.2.3 Exchange Rate Determination .................................................................. 148
  12.2.4 Is building CGE models worthwhile? ....................................................... 149
12.3 Summary ........................................................................................................ 150

13 Discussion II: Implications for Policy .............................................................. 152
  13.1 What were the likely consequences of Structural Adjustment Policies in Ghana? 152
  13.2 Answering Our Research Questions ............................................................. 157
    13.2.1 Why Was Macroeconomic Performance Not Sustained? .......................... 157
    13.2.2 What Were the Distributive Impacts of the Structural Adjustment Policies in the 1990s? .................................................. 159
  13.3 Policy Suggestions ...................................................................................... 159
    13.3.1 Trade Policy ......................................................................................... 160
    13.3.2 Sectoral Policies .................................................................................. 160
    13.3.3 Fiscal Policy ....................................................................................... 161
    13.3.4 Exchange Rate Policy ........................................................................ 161
    13.3.5 Monetary Policy ................................................................................ 162
  13.4 Summary ...................................................................................................... 162

14 Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 164

A The structure of the SAM .................................................................................. 167

B Decomposition with Respect to a Basis Using a Scalar Product .......................... 169
# List of Tables

3.1 *Indicators of Ghana’s adherence to Structural Adjustment policies.* ........................................... 28  
5.1 *A Simple Social Accounting Matrix* ....................................................................................... 50  
5.2 *Structure of the Financial Accounting Matrix* ........................................................................ 55  
5.3 *Central Bank Balance Sheet* ..................................................................................................... 57  
5.4 *Banking System Balance Sheet* .................................................................................................. 57  
7.1 *Data Sources. The italicized sources have not been used in compiling our dataset.* ............... 67  
7.2 *The Sectoral Disaggregation of Ghana National Accounts* ..................................................... 71  
7.3 *The Sectoral Grouping Used in This Thesis* ................................................................................. 72  
7.4 *Imports/Exports By Sector* ........................................................................................................ 74  
7.5 *The real production flows* ......................................................................................................... 77  
7.6 *The Leontief Matrix* .................................................................................................................. 78  
7.7 *Overall Social Accounting Matrix Structure* ............................................................................ 79  
7.8 *Factor Shares in Value Added* .................................................................................................... 81  
7.9 *Structure of the Financial Accounting Matrix* .......................................................................... 82  
8.1 *The transaction matrix for creation of new local-currency denominated loans* ..................... 92  
8.2 *Transaction Matrices Used in this Thesis* .................................................................................. 97  
9.1 *Ratio of investment to GDP as function of relative price of imports and of interest rates* ........ 101  
9.2 *Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in industrial production as function of relative price* ........ 103  
9.3 *Ratio of exports to nontraded goods in agricultural production as function of relative price* .... 104  
9.4 *Private consumption plus investment as share of private disposable income* ....................... 109  
9.5 *Consumption of industrial goods as function of total consumption and relative price* .......... 110  
9.6 *Ratio of imports to nontraded goods in consumed industrial goods as function of relative price*. 111  
9.7 *Ratio of imports to nontraded in consumed non-government services as function of relative price*. 112  
11.1 *Preliminary Lag Structure Examination for CPI* ................................................................. 121  
11.2 *ARIMA-X model identification for \( D.\ cpi \)* ................................................................. 122  
11.3 *ARIMA-X regression for \( D.\ cpi \)* ......................................................................................... 123  
11.4 *Summary of ARIMA-X regression for \( D.\ cpi \)* ................................................................. 124  
11.5 *ARIMA-X model identification for \( D.\ m2 \)* ................................................................. 128
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table No.</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>ARIMA-X regression for D.m2</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.m2</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>ARIMA-X model identification for D.m2, no constant</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>ARIMA-X regression for D.m2, no constant</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.10</td>
<td>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.m2, no constant</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>Preliminary Lag Structure Examination for the Exchange Rate</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.12</td>
<td>ARIMA-X model identification for D.er</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.13</td>
<td>ARIMA-X regression for D.er</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.14</td>
<td>Summary of ARIMA-X regression for D.er</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.1</td>
<td>The Blocks of the Social Accounting Matrix</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# List of Figures

3.1 Population Growth, Annual (World Development Indicators 2002) .................................................. 25
3.2 GDP growth, Annual (World Development Indicators 2002) ............................................................. 26
3.3 GDP Deflator, Annual Inflation (World Development Indicators 2002) ........................................... 27
3.4 Debt to GDP ratio (World Development Indicators 2002) ................................................................. 27
3.5 Composition of the Fiscal Deficit (International Monetary Fund) .......................................................... 28
3.6 Monetary Policy Indicators .................................................................................................................... 30
3.7 Employment composition (GLSS1-4 and author’s estimates) .............................................................. 32
3.8 Average Households’ Income Composition in 1993 by Main Occupation (author’s estimates from GLSS4 data) ........................................................................................................................................ 33
3.9 Effective Tariff Rates on Trade (World Development Indicators 2002, Oduro [2000], International Monetary Fund) .................................................................................................................. 35
3.10 GDP, imports, and exports in real terms (author’s estimates, Chapter 7) .............................................. 36
3.11 Some Price Indices (IMF Ghana Desk Country Reports and author’s estimates) .................................. 37

5.1 A simple money flow diagram .................................................................................................................. 50
5.2 A more realistic SAM ............................................................................................................................. 51
5.3 Real Product Flows .................................................................................................................................. 52

7.1 Shares of Subsectors in Value Added ..................................................................................................... 68
7.2 Manufacturing output discrepancy .......................................................................................................... 68
7.3 Sectoral Deflators (Source: World Development Indicators 2002; International Monetary Fund) .......... 69
7.4 Investment to GDP ratios computed from nominal resp. real time series (source: International Monetary Fund) ........................................................................................................................................... 70
7.5 Our Overall Accounting Framework as a Flow Chart ......................................................................... 76
7.6 Share of foreign-denominated loans and deposits in the respective total ............................................. 84
7.7 Relative Adjustments During FAM/SAM Reconciliation ...................................................................... 87
7.8 Total Multiplier Effect as Function of Total On-Impact Household Income ........................................ 88
7.9 The Patterns of Multiplier Income For Different Injections .................................................................. 88

9.1 Ratio of Investment to GDP (log scale) .................................................................................................. 102
9.2 Food crop production, wholesale price of food crops relative to the CPI and land area under cultivation ................................................................................................................................. 105
9.3 Net Lending By Institution ................................................................................................................... 108
9.4 Taylor Decomposition of Demand Injections ....................................................................................... 108

11.1 Inflation and Money Supply Growth .................................................................................................... 120
11.2 Contributions to Inflation Derived from Table 11.3 ......................................................................... 125
11.3 Actual CPI vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions ................................................. 126
11.4 Actual M2 vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions .................................................. 130
11.5 Actual M2 vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions without a constant term .......... 132
11.6 Impact of a unit increase in $m2$ on $cpi$ ...................................................................... 134
11.7 Impact of a unit increase in $cpi$ on $m2$ ...................................................................... 134
11.8 Actual exchange rate vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions ............................... 137
11.9 Actual exchange rate vs. predictions from ARIMA-X regressions without a constant
term ................................................................................................................................. 138
11.10 Inflation vs. Depreciation for Falling vs. Floating Periods ........................................... 139
11.11 Exchange Rate Depreciation, Falling/Floating Periods, and Foreign Exchange Re-
serve ..................................................................................................................................... 140